

# HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR SCOTLAND

## MINUTES OF MEETING 17 DECEMBER 2004

### THE GLENESK HOTEL, EDZELL

**Present:** Liz Burns (Chair)  
Peter Burman  
Neil Galbraith  
Martin Hulse  
Ian Johnson  
Finlay Lockie  
Eleanor McAllister  
Charles McKean  
Clare Meredith  
Ross Noble  
Andrew Wright  
Malcolm Bangor-Jones (Secretary)

**In attendance:** John Graham, Chief Executive and Director, Historic Scotland  
Sheenagh Adams, Director of Heritage Policy, Historic Scotland  
Susan Williamson, Head of Heritage Policy, Historic Scotland

#### **Welcome and apologies**

1. The Chair welcomed John Graham. Apologies were received from Mark Hopton.

#### **Historic Scotland Corporate Plan**

2. John Graham reported that Historic Scotland was about to start preparing its corporate plan for the period 1 April 2005 to 31 March 2008. The agency knew its financial settlement for next three financial years and it was considered advantageous that the corporate plan should cover the same period of the spending review. There were limited grounds for rolling forward the plan every year and it was envisaged that the Plan would remain unchanged for two years at least. In putting together the new plan Historic Scotland was engaging in more consultation than in the past. The agency had, for instance, written to all local authorities and was to meet with BEFS. Historic Scotland was presently at the stage of gathering ideas. The five aims in the 2004 Framework Document presented a fixed starting point.

3. The following points were made in discussion:

- funding for conservation officer posts in local authorities (this was done by English Heritage);
- funding for local authorities to carry out threatened building surveys (this was done by English Heritage);

- revenue support for BPTs;
- development of qualitative performance indicators;
- the agency should encourage and promote the continuing intellectual development of its professional staff. This would be of material assistance when Inspectors appeared at Public Inquiries;
- commitment to statutory protection of Designed Landscapes & Gardens;
- greater protection for the archaeology of buildings;
- protection for battlefields;
- Angus Council presentation: the “legislation works against the buildings not for them”;
- what would Historic Scotland be doing to build capacity in the wider historic environment sector? Would the agency, for instance, support IIP? Capacity building through raising understanding of the issues;
- how could the historic environment sector influence the Cultural Commission;
- contribution which the historic environment made to cultural identity;
- more popular publications, in addition to technical publications;
- commitment to partnership working: how would this impact, including the implementation of the heritage audit;
- Historic Scotland as an enabler, particularly in relation to local authorities;
- need to revise Historic Scotland’s mission statement: should show greater commitment to long term strategy; more clarity required;
- highlight new developments;
- should be more vigorous about modern buildings as part of the historic environment;
- be explicit about the agency’s IT strategy;
- greater clarity at Ministerial level and in relation to the mission statement: too often objectives, actions and indicators did not match. Actions and indicators were too focused on the Properties in Care side;
- emphasise the contribution to Economic Regeneration: need to take on board and engage with the Enterprise network, Communities Scotland and Smart Successful Scotland.
- protection for the wider historic environment which was not covered by the legislation.
- expansion not only of stonemasonry training but also training in traditional skills, both for Historic Scotland staff, and also to empower local communities to look after their historic environment;
- issue of no primary moveable conservation training being available in Scotland
- suggestion that should use the term “historic estate” instead of Properties in Care; and
- the importance of opening up the agency to outside scrutiny.

4. Historic Scotland thanked Council for its suggestions and comments. The agency might provide HEACS with more developed thoughts after it had considered the response provided by the public consultation.

#### **Minutes of the meeting of 23 September 2004**

5. The minutes of the meeting were approved.

## **Matters arising**

### Budget

**HEACS(04)64**

6. Council noted the Budget paper. It was reported that expenditure on catering for the conference had been less than expected. Council recognised that, while it was operating within its allocation, the cost of the conference could only be afforded through the lack of expenditure on consultancies. Concerns were expressed about the sufficiency of Council's administrative support, particularly in relation to its Working Groups. Council noted that the published format of the Audit Report had set a precedent and that there would be a need for additional resources for future reports. It was agreed that these issues should be considered by the Chair's Group.

**Action: Chair's Group**

### Meeting with Turcan Connell

7. The Chair reported on a meeting she had attended with representatives of Turcan Connell. They had expressed a particular interest in the work of the Legislation Working Group.

### Audit Scotland: Future Study Programme

8. Neil Galbraith undertook to keep a look out for Audit Scotland's report of its proposed study of business management arrangements relating to failing visitor attractions.

**Action: Neil Galbraith**

### Meeting with the Minister

9. It was noted that Council would meet with the Minister for Tourism, Culture and Sport on 13 January to discuss the Annual Report and Audit Report. It was agreed that Council would be represented by the Chair and Vice-Chairs.

### Dumfries House

10. Council noted that Peter Burman would brief the Chair on Dumfries House.

**Action: Peter Burman**

## **Working Group reports**

### Legislation Working Group

**HEACS(04)65**

11. Council noted the reports of the two meetings of the Legislation Working Group. Andrew Wright reported that there had been considerable interest in the Group's work on the part of practitioners. The Group was now engaged in drawing out common issues for inclusion in a draft paper. Council noted that the Group had been provided by Historic Scotland with a copy of the list of issues which the agency had drawn up for possible inclusion in the proposed Planning Bill.

### Audit Working Group

12. Council noted that the Audit Working Group would continue to hold a watching brief.

### Local Authorities Working Group

**HEACS(04)66**

13. Council noted the reports of the two meetings of the Local Authorities Working Group. Ian Johnson reported that the Group had taken stock and would be meeting with several key players. The Group had identified four topics which might form the basis for its report to Ministers. The Group would concentrate on two: community planning and the historic environment; and the human and financial resources available to local authorities. However, the Group had also felt that the perception emerging within local authorities that there was a difference between the historic environment and the cultural heritage, and the extent to which education in its widest sense focussed on the historic environment, were both important topics. The Group considered that Council might wish to consider the latter topic at a later date. Council agreed that it might be raised in due course within the context of Council's Forward Plan. Council considered the Group's remit and noted that Historic Scotland had provided a briefing paper to Council on the role of local authorities and also on community planning. It was noted that the Chair and Ian Johnson would attend the first meeting of the Historic Environment Local Authority Forum on 14 January.

[John Graham left the meeting: Finlay Lockie joined the meeting]

### Materials and Skills Working Group

**HEACS(04)67**

14. Council noted the report of the Group's meeting, the Group's recent visit to Charles Taylor, Dalkeith and Eoin Cox of Woodskill, and arrangements for future meetings. The Group had been struck by the lack of contact between the various training initiatives in Scotland. Council commented on the lack of skilled woodworkers operating at the middle rather than the top end of the scale. The HELM initiative in England was discussed. It was suggested that consideration should be given to those specialist skills, for instance the repair of ceramics or wall tiles, which were under-represented or not available in Scotland. Concern was expressed that the Historic Scotland TCRE reports were too theoretical and not being used by the ordinary practitioner.

### Properties in Care Working Group

**HEACS(04)68**

15. Council noted the report of the Group's meeting. The Group would also be taking account of NTS acquisition policy. While the Group intended to refer to the position elsewhere in the UK, it was doubtful if reference would be made to the situation in other European countries. The Group intended to make a draft consultation paper available to Council members by the end of February for consideration at the next Council meeting.

Infrastructure Working Group

**HEACS(04)69**

16. Council noted the reports of the meetings of the Group. The meeting with Historic Scotland and BEFS to discuss the possibility of the proposed research work being undertaken for all three bodies would now take place in the New Year. While such an approach was to be welcomed, it was essential that the Group's own needs were met. The Group was likely to concentrate on the voluntary sector, but it would also consider the position of local authorities.

Economic Significance Working Group

**HEACS(04)70**

17. Council noted the reports of the meetings of the Group. Mention was made of the contribution of the historic environment to the generation of social capital, particularly through volunteering. There was an awareness that the Group's report would touch on matters which were not necessarily the responsibility of Historic Scotland and it was recognised that Council would need to consider which Minister(s) the report should be submitted to.

Funding Working Group

**HEACS(04)71**

18. Council noted that a Synopsis Paper had been submitted to the Chair's Group meeting in November when it had been agreed that a meeting involving Historic Scotland, HEACS and the HLF should be arranged in the first instance. The availability of relevant information was discussed. It was suggested that the Group would need to consider the long-term implications of current changes in patterns of funding. Council agreed that the Group would consist of the Chair, Andrew Wright, Peter Burman and Martin Hulse.

**Action: Secretary**

**Committee reports**

Chair's Group

**HEACS(04)72**

19. Council noted the record of the meeting of the Chair's Group.

Argyll Study Tour

20. Council considered various suggestions for the Argyll Study Tour as to possible themes to pursue or properties to visit. It was agreed that the Secretary should collate all suggestions and that these would be considered by the Chair's Group.

**Action: Secretary**

Press Cuttings Service

21. Council agreed that the press cuttings service should continue.

Conference and Public Meeting

**HEACS(04)73**

22. Council considered the format of the Conference/Public Meeting for 2005. Council's preference was for a half-day event and it was agreed to remit the matter

back to the Chair's Group. In the meantime, Members were invited to submit ideas for speakers and/or possible themes.

**Action: Members**

#### Meetings in 2006

**HEACS(04)74**

23. Council considered the locations for its quarterly meetings in 2006. It was agreed that Council would meet in Dumfries & Galloway (March); Western Isles (June), Falkirk (September) and Paisley and Renfrew (December).

#### Forward Plan 2005

**HEACS(04)75**

24. Council considered the draft Forward Plan for 2005. Various amendments were made to the entries relating to Working Groups. Council agreed the Forward Plan.

#### Communications Group

25. There was nothing to report from the Communications Group.

#### **Consultation papers**

##### Historic Scotland: Historic Environment Grants

**HEACS(04)76**

26. Council noted its response to the consultation and thanked Ross Noble and Mark Hopton for their work.

##### CAP Reform

**HEACS(04)77**

27. Council considered the concerns about the implications of CAP Reform for the historic environment which had been expressed by Jonathan Wordsworth following Council's Public Meeting in September. There was particular concern over the lack of resources to make information about the historic environment available to farmers. There was a possibility that the historic environment in Scotland would be less well cared for than elsewhere in the United Kingdom. Council agreed that Ian Johnson would draft a letter for the Chair to send to Ross Finnie and Patricia Ferguson. He would also keep in touch with Historic Scotland over the issue.

##### Climatic Change

28. Council noted that the Scottish Executive consultation on Climatic Change would be considered.

#### **Cultural Commission**

**HEACS(04)78**

29. Council noted the Interim Report by the Cultural Commission and proceeded to consider the 62 Pan-Sectoral Questions which formed Phase 2 of the Commission's Stakeholder Consultation. Members undertook to pass draft responses to the various sections to Neil Galbraith by 7 January for incorporation into Council's response.

**Action: Members**

## Information exchange with Historic Scotland

HEACS(04)79

30. Council was informed of progress in appointing three non executive Directors to the Management Board and the appointment of a new Chief Inspector. The results of the consultation exercises referred to at the last meeting were or would soon be on the Historic Scotland website. The agency was considering the production of a policy framework consisting of a series of Scottish Historic Environment Policy statements (SHEPs) to be accompanied by guidance and action plans on specific issues. A paper would be presented to HEACS in due course. An update was provided on Castle Tioram and the proposals to convert Taymouth Castle into a hotel.

31. Council noted the note of the Chair's Group meeting with Historic Scotland. A visit to the agency would be arranged in due course.

**Action: Historic Scotland**

## Meetings with other bodies

### Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

HEACS(04)80

32. Council noted the meeting with the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland. Working Groups were invited to take note of the Society's interest in their work.

**Action: Working Group Chairs**

## A O B

### John Muir Trust Wild Land Conference

33. Ross Noble reported on the John Muir Trust Wild Land Conference. The point had been made by those with an interest in the historic environment that there was virtually no area in Scotland which did not bear the footprint of people. An appreciation of the historic environment could enhance the 'wild land' experience.

### Working Groups Travel and Expenses

34. Council noted that Working Groups could offer travel and expenses to those invited to give evidence.

### UKIC

35. Clare Meredith reported on progress towards the establishment of the new Institute of Conservation.

## Date of next meeting

36. The next meeting would be held on 18 March 2005 in Aberdeenshire.

**HEACS  
January 2005**