

**HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR SCOTLAND**

**MINUTES OF MEETING 23 SEPTEMBER 2004**

**MILLENNIUM HOTEL, GLASGOW**

**Present:** Liz Burns (Chair)  
Peter Burman  
Neil Galbraith  
Mark Hopton  
Ian Johnson  
Finlay Lockie  
Eleanor McAllister  
Charles McKean  
Clare Meredith  
Ross Noble  
Andrew Wright  
Malcolm Bangor-Jones (Secretary)

**In attendance:** Sheenagh Adams, Director of Heritage Policy, Historic Scotland  
Susan Williamson, Head of Heritage Policy, Historic Scotland

**Apologies**

1. Apologies were received from Martin Hulse.

**Antonine Wall**

2. Council wished to record its thanks to David Breeze for providing complimentary copies of the Historic Scotland/RCAHMS publication on the Antonine Wall, part of the proposed World Heritage Site, The Frontiers of the Roman Empire. Council noted the positive press interest which had been generated.

**Minutes of the meeting of 19 June 2004**

3. The minutes of the meeting were approved.

**Matters arising**

Standing Orders

**HEACS(04)48**

4. The Standing Orders were approved.

Budget

**HEACS(04)49**

5. Council noted the Budget paper. A bid had been submitted to Historic Scotland for provision for the financial year 2005-06. It was noted that the paper only covered

those items under Council's direct control. Council agreed that the costs associated with the Secretariat would be identified in a separate note.

#### Historic Scotland Review

**HEACS(04)50**

6. Council noted the correspondence with Frank McAveety, the Minister for Tourism, Culture and Sport concerning the review of Historic Scotland.

#### Historic Scotland Corporate Plan

**HEACS(04)51**

7. Council noted the correspondence concerning the consultation on the Historic Scotland Corporate Plan. The Chair thanked those members who had assisted in drawing up Council's response.

#### RCAHMS Corporate Plan

8. Council noted that no response had been made to the RCAHMS Corporate Plan which had already been submitted to the Minister, Frank McAveety.

#### Meeting with the Minister

9. Council noted the record of the meeting with the Minister, Frank McAveety, on 3 August. Those present felt that it had been a constructive meeting. It was noted that the Minister had emphasised the importance of positioning the historic environment closer to Scottish Executive priorities. Council discussed the need for a Strategy Statement which had been mentioned in the Report of the Review of Historic Scotland. It was reported by Historic Scotland that this was being considered and that the agency would submit a paper to HEACS in due course.

#### Dates for Council Meetings

10. Council noted that the dates for the Study Tour had been altered to 16 to 18 June 2005.

### **Working Group reports**

#### Legislation Working Group

**HEACS(04)52**

11. Council noted the report of the HEACS/BEFS seminar on the review of heritage protection legislation in England. The seminar had been a useful event. It was noted that the Working Group might adopt a two-part approach to its work: consisting of an interim report setting out possible changes for submission to and discussion with the Minister, followed by an examination of resources and priorities. It was agreed that, in the meantime, the possibility of provisions for the historic environment being included in the Planning Bill should be ascertained.

Audit Working Group

**HEACS(04)53**

12. Council agreed the Report of the Audit Working Group. It was agreed that the Report should be transformed into published report format for submission to the Minister. Council thanked the Working Group and in particular Neil Galbraith for an excellent report.

Local Authorities Working Group

**HEACS(04)54**

13. Council noted that Martin Hulse had stepped down as Chair of the Local Authorities Working Group. Ian Johnson had taken over as Chair and Neil Galbraith had agreed to join the Group. The issue of local authority staffing, including training for Building Control Officers, the lack of reference to the historic environment in cultural strategies, and the roll-out of community planning were all discussed.

Skills and Materials Working Group

**HEACS(04)55**

14. Council noted the record of the meetings of the Skills and Materials Working Group which had visited Mansfield Place Church and St Mary's Cathedral Workshop. It was hoped that the Group would be in a position to have a draft report by the spring.

Properties in Care Working Group

15. Council noted that the Properties in Care Working Group was in the process of considering a detailed paper. The Group intended to deal with two issues: the criteria for taking properties into state care, and the matter of properties at risk.

Infrastructure Working Group

**HEACS(04)56**

16. Council noted the record of the meetings of the Infrastructure Working Group and its remit. The Group had concluded that its proposed mapping exercise would not cut across the work that BEFS had been carrying out in this area. The Group proposed that its questionnaire survey should concentrate on national and regional organisations. Council discussed possible consultees. It was agreed that Council should meet with BEFS on a regular basis to discuss this and other areas of mutual interest.

**Action: Chair**

Economic Importance Working Group

17. Council noted that the Working Group on the Economic Importance of the Historic Environment would be holding its first meeting shortly. The Group would comprise Neil Galbraith, Ian Johnson and Eleanor McAllister.

Funding Working Group

18. Council discussed the establishment of the Funding Working Group in the light of the Historic Scotland Consultation on Building Repairs Grants and also the pressures on Lottery funding, both in the short and longer term. Members wishing to become involved in the Working Group were invited to contact Andrew Wright.

## **Committee reports**

### Communications

19. Council noted that the Communications Group had met to discuss the design of the Annual Report. It was agreed that the Group should wherever possible assist Council in achieving an overall style.

### Chair's Group

**HEACS(04)57**

20. Council noted the record of the meeting of the Chair's group. It was noted that the Secretary would scan the major Scottish newspapers and forward articles of potential interest to Members on a monthly basis. Members could forward articles for general circulation.

### Annual Report

21. Council thanked those Members, particularly Mark Hopton, who had been involved in the production of the Annual Report. It was suggested that next year's report might contain a summary of any reports submitted to the Minister.

## **Consultation papers**

### Scottish Executive: Protecting our Marine Environment

**HEACS(04)58**

22. Council noted its response to the consultation.

### Scottish Executive: Rights of Appeal in Planning

**HEACS(04)59**

23. Council noted its response to the consultation.

### SNH: Guidance on Local Landscape Designations

**HEACS(04)60**

24. Council noted its response to the consultation. It was reported that there appeared to be an emerging agenda presaging a more holistic approach towards landscape designations and the possibility of pressure being applied for the adoption of the principles of the European Landscape Convention.

25. Council thanked Neil Galbraith, Andrew Wright and Ian Johnson for their work on these papers.

### Historic Scotland Grants Consultation

**HEACS(04)61**

26. Council considered the Historic Scotland consultation on historic environment grants along with a briefing paper tabled by Mark Hopton which raised a number of strategic issues. Points raised in discussion included: support for Building Preservation Trusts, loss of buildings in conservation areas, the role of churches and private owners; the process whereby the merit of a building was evaluated; transparency and the provision of external scrutiny; the role which an audit of the

historic environment might play; the involvement of stakeholders; and the issue of resources. Council noted that Historic Scotland intended to establish a Steering Group to take forward the proposed Regeneration Fund. It was agreed that Ross Noble, who had been drafting a response by the Skills and Materials Working Group, would forward the Group's comments to Mark Hopton and also make them available to Historic Scotland. Mark Hopton would circulate a draft response to the consultation.

**Action: Mark Hopton, Ross Noble**

Cultural Commission

**HEACS(04)62**

27. The Chair reported that she had written to James Boyle chair of the Cultural Commission. HEACS had been invited to a seminar on 25 August but it had been cancelled at the last minute. Council considered the invitation to contribute to Phase 1 of the Commission's Consultation Process. Concern was expressed as to the use of the term 'entitlements'. It was felt that emphasis should instead be placed on the importance of cultural memory and education in enabling access. Reference was made to work undertaken during the Review of Historic Scotland on where the historic environment sat within Ministerial portfolios elsewhere in Europe. It was agreed that Charles McKean would draft a response.

**Action: Charles McKean**

Charities & Trustee Investment (Scotland) Bill

**HEACS(04)63**

28. The Chair drew Council's attention to the proposals in the Scottish Executive Draft Charities and Trustee Investment (Scotland) Bill which included a Scottish definition of a charity with a requirement to demonstrate public benefit. It was noted that this might have an adverse impact on certain organisations or entities connected with the historic environment. The Chair was to meet with Douglas Connell of Turcan Connell to explore the issue. If necessary she would write to the Minister for Communities.

**Action: Chair**

Audit Scotland: Future Study Programme

29. Council agreed that it would not respond to the consultation. It was noted that the proposed study of business management arrangements relating to failing visitor attractions in Scotland might be of interest.

Scottish Biodiversity

30. Council agreed that this might receive a standard response.

**Action: Secretary**

Scottish Executive: Strategic Environmental Assessment

31. Council agreed that this might receive a standard response.

**Action: Secretary**

## **Conference and Public Meeting**

32. Council reviewed the Conference and Public Meeting in terms of the attendance, content and organisation. Alternative models for the event were discussed as was the desirability of engaging with the wider public. It was agreed that the Chair's Group should give consideration to next year's event which was to be held in Edinburgh.

**Action: Chair's Group**

## **Information exchange with Historic Scotland**

33. Council was informed of various senior staff changes at Historic Scotland and of the intention to appoint three non executive Directors to the Management Board. The restructuring within Heritage Policy Group was continuing, the responses to the consultation exercises on Defining National Importance and Carved Stones were being analysed, and a new approach to the Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes was under consideration. Historic Scotland was in the process of drawing up its budget for 2005-06 and HEACS would be consulted on the agency's new Corporate Plan in due course.

## **A O B**

### Forward Plan

34. It was agreed that the Chair's Group should consider next year's Forward Plan.

**Action: Chair's Group**

### Composition of Working Groups

35. Council discussed the desirability of ensuring broad range of outside interests on its Working Groups.

### Dumfries House

36. Council's attention was drawn to a letter from Peter Burman in his capacity as Director of Conservation & Property Services at the NTS asking the Chair to express support for a bid to acquire Dumfries House. It was agreed that it would be inappropriate for Council as an advisory body to express support for particular cases.

## **Date of next meeting**

37. The next meeting would be held on Friday 17 December at Edzell in Angus.

**HEACS  
October 2004**