

HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR SCOTLAND

MINUTES OF MEETING HELD ON FRIDAY 19 DECEMBER 2003

NEW LANARK

Present: Mrs Liz Burns (Chair)
Dr Peter Burman
Mr Neil Galbraith
Mr Mark Hopton
Mr Martin Hulse
Mr Ian Johnson
Mr Finlay Lockie
Prof. Charles McKean
Ms Eleanor McAllister
Mrs Clare Meredith
Mr Ross Noble
Mr Andrew Wright
Dr Malcolm Bangor-Jones (Secretary)
Dr Bill McQueen (Assistant Secretary)

In attendance: Mrs Susan Williamson (Historic Scotland)

Apologies and introductory remarks

1. The following papers were tabled:

HEACS website (discussed under agenda item 4.3)
Note of meeting between Chairs Group and Historic Scotland. (discussed under 6.25)
Note of Taking Properties into Care Working Group meeting (discussed under 5.5)
A newspaper clipping on Industrial Museums (discussed under section 8)

2. There were no apologies.

Minutes of the meeting of 7 October 2003

3. The minutes of the meeting of 7 October were agreed.

Notes from the meeting of 6 October 2003

4. The notes of the meeting of 6 October were agreed.

Matters Arising

Six Monthly Report to the Minister

HEACS(03)11

5. It was noted that the Chair had sent a six monthly report on the Council's activities to the Minister, Frank McAveety. It was noted that the Minister had not yet responded to an invitation to meet Council.

Meetings with other Agencies

RCAHMS

HEACS(03)12

6. The minute of the meeting with RCAHMS was noted. The Commission would be willing to arrange a tour for those Council members who were unable to visit on 21 October. The Secretariat would organise a visit if Members wished.

ACTION: Secretariat

7. It was suggested that Council might wish to consider the relationship between RCAHMS and Historic Scotland in due course. It was reported that a concordat setting out the working relations between Historic Scotland and RCAHMS had been agreed. It was agreed that Charles McKean, in liaison with Neil Galbraith and Ian Johnson, should draft a discussion paper on RCAHMS for the next HEACS meeting.

ACTION: Charles McKean

Other meetings

8. It was noted that further meetings with other organisations/agencies were in the process of being arranged.

9. The Chair reported that she had spoken at a meeting of Scottish Archaeology Link in November. The Chair had seen this network as a useful point of contact for HEACS, and had asked for HEACS to be on their mailing list. Council members could attend meetings from time to time, and report.

ACTION: Secretariat

Website

10. Council noted two papers which were tabled concerning the Council's website: one drafted by Secretariat at the Chair's request and the other being Mark Hopton's record of a meeting with Eleanor McAllister and the Secretariat. Council discussed the issue and agreed that further thought should be given to the scope and design of the website. The Working Group might give further consideration to these issues. Council discussed the use of images and agreed that the site should be minimalist in terms of design and content at this stage of HEACS' existence. It was agreed that, in the meantime, a website based on version heacsb.htm should go live.

ACTION: Secretariat

HEACS's Response to consultation Modernising PLIs

HEACS(03)13

11. The Council noted HEACS's response to the Scottish Executive consultation on Modernising PLIs. It was noted that there was little public involvement in the development of local plans. It was agreed that Council should consider how the Minister might encourage greater public participation.

Future Meetings

12. It was agreed that the March Council meeting would be convened in Inverness. It was suggested that Council might visit a site in the area. It was noted that the Council would visit the borders for the Annual Tour or Study Visit in June.

13. Council discussed its Conference and Open Meeting scheduled to be held in Glasgow on 22 September. It was noted that Professor Smout had agreed to speak. It was agreed that the Chair, Charles McKean, Peter Burman and Eleanor McAllister should form a Conference Planning Group. HEACS should aim to attract 200-250 attendees to the Conference. The event would be advertised in national newspapers and letters would be written to all relevant bodies. Access would be by ticket only.

ACTION: Chair, Charles McKean, Peter Burman, Eleanor McAllister

Working Groups

Legislation Working Group

HEACS(O3)14(1)

14. Council noted the report of the Heritage Legislation Working Group. Stuart Eydman and Terry Levinthal had agreed to serve as external member of the Group. Carol Swanson and Christopher Dingwall had attended the meeting on 4 December and were prepared to continue to assist the Group. Andy Burrell, a developer, and Laura Norris, Chair of the APT in Scotland, had agreed to give evidence at the Group's next meeting.

Audit Working Group

HEACS(03)14(2&3)

15. Council noted the report of the Audit Working Group. The Group had not co-opted any external members but had decided to consult widely. The Group was considering holding a scoping meeting but was aware that the Built Environment Forum for Scotland was undertaking work in this area.

Local Authorities Working Group

HEACS(03)14(4)

16. Council noted the report of the Local Authorities Working Group. Charles Strang and Carol Swanson had been invited to join the Group. The Working Group was aware that a considerable amount of research in this area had already been undertaken and the Group had decided to look into the possibility of commissioning research. The group had also agreed to revise its remit.

Materials and Skills Working Group

HEACS(03)14(5)

17. The Council noted the report of the Materials and Skills Working Group. Eleanor McAllister had stood down from the Group and Ms Liz Davidson would be approached to serve as an external member. Mr Ingval Maxwell, Director of TCRE at Historic Scotland, had also been co-opted to serve on the Working Group.

Properties in Care Working Group

HEACS(03)14(6)

18. Council noted the report of the Properties in Care Working Group.

General Comments

19. It was agreed that Working Group papers and notes of meetings should be regarded as working papers. They could be circulated to external members on the basis that their contents were confidential. Individuals who gave evidence to a Working Group might be offered an extract of the notes covering their appearance.

20. Council was keen to ensure that co-opted members were re-imbursed for travel and subsistence costs. Secretariat was currently seeking advice on this issue.

ACTION: Secretariat

Chair's Group

Minutes of Meeting of 24 November

HEACS(03)15

21. Council noted the minutes of the Chair's Group meeting of 24 November. Council agreed that the ordinary member of the Chair's Group should be appointed on a 1-year rotational basis. It was noted that Martin Hulse had agreed to serve as the ordinary member on the Group until 31 May 2004.

Matters Arising

HEACS Agenda

HEACS(03)16

22. The Council considered topics which might be considered during its first term and their order of priority. After discussion, it was agreed that the Council would examine:

- the economic contribution of the historic environment. It was agreed that this was the most important issue. It was suggested that a scoping study might be commissioned to examine the issue;
- the requirement for a Government policy statement on the historic environment to fill the gap in the Cultural Strategy;
- the importance of the historic environment infrastructure. This should include an examination of the role of the voluntary sector and ways of strengthening that role and making it more effective;
- the development of qualitative targets for the Historic Environment; and
- information technology and the Historic Environment

It was agreed that these 5 topics should be prioritised.

Standing Orders

HEACS(03)17

DRAFT

23. Council considered the draft Standing Orders. It was agreed that paragraph 4.1 should be amended to read: “no decision shall be made at the Council meeting unless at least seven voting members (a quorum) participate”. Council discussed the implications of Annex A (and paragraph 5.1 and associated footnote) concerning the provisions of the Official Secrets Act. The Secretariat undertook to look into this issue.

ACTION: Secretariat

24. With reference to paragraph 4.5 it was agreed that members with a potential interest to declare in an agenda item should declare it in advance of the meeting to allow the Chair to consider whether the member might be permitted to participate in the discussion. The second sentence of paragraph 6.2 should be amended to read: “Each will be chaired by a member of Council and will normally include...”. The number of external members appointed would not normally exceed the number of Council members. Paragraph 7.3 should be amended to read “if any member(s), who has participated in the debate, disagree(s)”. The Standing Orders should be reviewed every three years. It was agreed that the Standing Orders would be amended with the intention of Council formally adopting them at the next meeting.

25. Council was reminded that members would have to provide an entry for a register of interests.

ACTION: Secretariat

26. Council agreed that the Secretariat could sound record meetings but only to assist with drafting the minutes.

ACTION: Secretariat

Work Plan for 2004

27. Council discussed HEACS’s workload for the coming year. It was noted that the Minister had asked for advice on five issues during Council’s first term. With regard to additional agenda items it was agreed that Council should address the work in hand first. However, Council agreed that it would be useful to set aside time for brainstorming sessions concerning additional topics to be considered by HEACS. Working Groups’ respective work programmes were also discussed.

28. It was noted that part of the Working Groups’ remit was to identify whether research might be required. It was noted that the Groups themselves should not necessarily commission or undertake research.

Budget

HEACS(03)18

29. Council noted the paper on HEACS’s estimated expenditure 2003-04 and 2004-05. It was felt that the amount allocated to Consultancy was low and an allocation of £20,000 was suggested. It was suggested that there should be an allocation for web site design. Historic Scotland informed Council that it would be free to make in-year bids for additional funding.

Report on Meeting with Historic Scotland

Tabled

30. It was reported that the Chair's Group had met with representatives of Historic Scotland to discuss operational issues including the provision of Secretariat support and public consultation exercises. It was agreed that the Chair's Group would sift consultation documents.

Review of Historic Scotland

HEACS(03)19

31. Council noted the minutes of the meeting with the Steering Group on the Review of Historic Scotland. The Chair had requested a meeting with the Minister to be convened before he responded to the Report. The Secretariat would ascertain whether members would be able to have sight of the Steering Group's summary document of the consultation exercise.

ACTION: Secretariat

Policy Matters

Speech by First Minister on 30 November

HEACS(03)20

32. Council noted the First Minister's speech of 30 November. Council was disappointed that the speech said so little about the Historic Environment.

Historic Scotland Corporate Plan

HEACS(03)21

33. Council noted Historic Scotland's Corporate Plan for 2003-2006. It was suggested that Council might wish to consider commenting on future Corporate Plans.

Consultation Paper on Treasure Trove

HEACS(03)22

34. Council noted the Scottish Executive consultation paper on Treasure Trove. Neil Galbraith agreed to co-ordinate a response having sought the views of appropriate parties.

ACTION: Neil Galbraith

SNH Consultation Paper on Scotland's Landscapes

HEACS(03)23

35. Council noted the SNH consultation paper on Scotland's Landscapes. It was suggested that the paper paid little regard to the Historic Environment. Ian Johnson agreed to draft a HEACS response.

ACTION: Ian Johnson

Review of Land Managed by Forestry Commission Scotland

HEACS(03)24

36. Council noted the Review of Land Managed by Forestry Commission Scotland. It was agreed that Council should respond to the paper. There were three issues which the Council might wish to address: historic woods; forestry and the destruction of archaeology; and future forests as a source of material for building and repair work. It was noted that Peter Burman would be attending the public meeting in Dundee (20th January) and Ian Johnson would attend the Glasgow meeting (28 January). Both agreed to report back to Council.

ACTION: Ian Johnson and Peter Burman

DRAFT

Industrial Museums

Press Cutting

37. Mr Hopton declared an interest in the Scottish Mining Museum.

38. Council considered the press cutting from the Sunday Herald about industrial museums in Scotland. It was agreed that the Chair would write to the Minister setting out Council's concerns raised by the contents of the press cutting and seeking further information on the issue.

ACTION: Chair

AOB

COSLA

39. The Council noted that COSLA was currently undergoing reorganisation. It was felt that the way in which HEACS approached COSLA would be crucial to developing an essential working relationship with Local Authorities.

RCAHMS

40. Council noted that it had been suggested that HEACS might meet with the RCAHMS Commissioners on 26 March.

ACTION: Chair

VAT

41. It was reported that a recent e-mail from Europa Nostra indicated that the issue of VAT was now the responsibility of individual member states. The UK Government was still considering the issue.

Date of Next Meeting

42. 10/11 March 2004, Inverness. Venue to be confirmed.

**HEACS
January 2004**